

## ARGUING ON THE TOULMIN MODEL

Argumentation Library

---

VOLUME 10

---

*Series Editors*

**Frans H. van Eemeren**, *University of Amsterdam*

**Scott Jacobs**, *University of Arizona*

**Erik C.W. Krabbe**, *University of Groningen*

**John Woods**, *University of Lethbridge*

# ARGUING ON THE TOULMIN MODEL

## New Essays in Argument Analysis and Evaluation

Edited by

DAVID HITCHCOCK

*Mc Master University,  
Hamilton, Canada*

and

BART VERHEIJ

*Rijksuniversiteit Groningen,  
Groningen, The Netherlands*

 Springer

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN-10 1-4020-4937-4 (HB)  
ISBN-13 978-1-4020-4937-4 (HB)  
ISBN-10 1-4020-4938-2 (e-book)  
ISBN-13 978-1-4020-4938-2 (e-book)

---

Published by Springer,  
P.O. Box 17, 3300 AA Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

*www.springer.com*

*Printed on acid-free paper*

All Rights Reserved

© 2006 Springer

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

## CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	VII
1 INTRODUCTION David Hitchcock and Bart Verheij	1
2 REASONING IN THEORY AND PRACTICE Stephen E. Toulmin	25
3 A CITATION-BASED REFLECTION ON TOULMIN AND ARGUMENT Ronald P. Loui	31
4 COMPLEX CASES AND LEGITIMATION INFERENCE: EXTENDING THE TOULMIN MODEL TO DELIBERATIVE ARGUMENT IN CONTROVERSY G. Thomas Goodnight	39
5 A METAMATHEMATICAL EXTENSION OF THE TOULMIN AGENDA Mark Weinstein	49
6 TOULMIN'S MODEL OF ARGUMENT AND THE QUESTION OF RELATIVISM Lilian Bermejo-Luque	71
7 SYSTEMATIZING TOULMIN'S WARRANTS: AN EPISTEMIC APPROACH James B. Freeman	87
8 WARRANTING ARGUMENTS, THE VIRTUE OF VERB James F. Klumpp	103
9 EVALUATING INFERENCES: THE NATURE AND ROLE OF WARRANTS Robert C. Pinto	115
10 'PROBABLY' Robert H. Ennis	145
11 THE VOICE OF THE OTHER: A DIALOGICO-RHETORICAL UNDERSTANDING OF OPPONENT AND OF TOULMIN'S REBUTTAL Wouter H. Slob	165
12 EVALUATING ARGUMENTS BASED ON TOULMIN'S SCHEME Bart Verheij	181
13 GOOD REASONING ON THE TOULMIN MODEL David Hitchcock	203

14	THE FLUIDITY OF WARRANTS: USING THE TOULMIN MODEL TO ANALYSE PRACTICAL DISCOURSE Olaf Tans	219
15	ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE & LAW, LOGIC AND ARGUMENT SCHEMES Henry Prakken	231
16	MULTIPLE WARRANTS IN PRACTICAL REASONING Christian Kock	247
17	THE QUEST FOR RATIONALISM WITHOUT DOGMAS IN LEIBNIZ AND TOULMIN Txetxu Ausín	261
18	FROM ARGUMENTS TO DECISIONS: EXTENDING THE TOULMIN VIEW John Fox and Sanjay Modgil	273
19	USING TOULMIN ARGUMENTATION TO SUPPORT DISPUTE SETTLEMENT IN DISCRETIONARY DOMAINS John Zeleznikow	289
20	TOULMIN'S MODEL AND THE SOLVING OF ILL-STRUCTURED PROBLEMS James F. Voss	303
21	ARGUING BY QUESTION: A TOULMINIAN READING OF CICERO'S ACCOUNT OF THE ENTHYMEME Manfred Kraus	313
22	THE USES OF ARGUMENT IN MATHEMATICS Andrew Aberdein	327
23	TRANSLATING TOULMIN DIAGRAMS: THEORY NEUTRALITY IN ARGUMENT REPRESENTATION Chris Reed and Glenn Rowe	341
24	THE TOULMIN TEST: FRAMING ARGUMENTATION WITHIN BELIEF REVISION THEORIES Fabio Paglieri and Cristiano Castelfranchi	359
25	EIGHT THESES REFLECTING ON STEPHEN TOULMIN John Woods	379
	CONTRIBUTORS	399
	REFERENCES	407
	INDEX	425

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The chapters in this volume have undergone peer review and were revised in the light of the resulting comments. We would like to thank the following referees and commentators for their help: Derek Allen, Richard T. W. Arthur, Peter Asquith, Mark Battersby, Trevor Bench-Capon, George Boger, Peter Cramer, Chris Eisenhart, James B. Freeman, Michael A. Gilbert, Tom Gordon, Leo Groarke, Dale Hample, Darrin Hicks, Anthony Hunter, Henrike Jansen, Ralph H. Johnson, James F. Klumpp, Christian Kock, Robert Kominar, Erik C. W. Krabbe, Ronald Leenes, Michael Leff, Ronald P. Loui, Peter McBurney, Daniel O’Keefe, Fabio Paglieri, Robert C. Pinto, Henry Prakken, Pedro Reygadas, Phyllis Rooney, Michael Scriven, Harvey Siegel, Guillermo Simari, Christina Slade, Robert G. Sullivan, Olaf Tans, Tim van Gelder, James Voss, Douglas Walton, Mark Weinstein, Joseph Wenzel, John Woods, John Zeleznikow.

We would also like to thank the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada for its financial support of the conference in May 2005 at McMaster University on “The uses of argument”, at which many of the papers in this volume were presented in preliminary form. The conference grant enabled us to hire an editorial assistant, Daniel Farr, to take care of the technical aspects of preparation of the manuscript of this book. Daniel was a reliable and capable editorial assistant, and we express our warm thanks to him for his dedication and professionalism.

For financial support of the May 2005 conference, we thank also McMaster University’s provost and vice-president academic Ken Norrie, its vice president research Mamdouh Shoukri, its dean of humanities Nasrin Rahimieh, and the chair of its philosophy department Richard T. W. Arthur.

For their support of this project and their help in preparing the manuscript, we thank Anne-Marie Blaney, Publishing Editor in Ethics and Philosophy of Law at Springer; her assistant Natalie Rieborn; Gerrit Oomen, André Tournois and Joseph Albert André of the Springer production department; and Deborah Doherty of Springer Author Support.

We thank the editors of the journal *Argumentation* for permission to reprint eight articles from a special issue (vol. 19, no. 3, 2005) of that journal on “the Toulmin model today”. The articles are the chapters by Andrew Aberdein, James B. Freeman, David Hitchcock, Ronald P. Loui, Henry Prakken, Chris Reed and Glenn Rowe, Bart Verheij, and James F. Voss.

Finally, we thank the editors of the journal *Informal Logic* for permission to reprint three articles from that journal. “Reasoning in Theory and Practice” by Stephen Toulmin was previously published in *Informal Logic* (vol. 24, no. 2, 2004), and is reprinted here with permission. “Toulmin’s Model of Argument and the Question of Relativism” by Lilian Bermejo Luque was previously published in *Informal Logic* (vol. 24, no. 2, 2004), and is reprinted here with permission. “Evaluating inferences: the nature and role of warrants” by Robert C. Pinto was previously published in *Informal Logic*, and is reprinted here with permission.